Contents Volume 17:1 March 1994

Baron, J. Nonconsequentialist decisions 1

Open Peer Commentary

Adler, J. E. Fairness to policies, distinctions and intuitions 10
Arkes, H. R. Three reservations about consequentialism 11
Ayton, P. & Harvey, N. Inappropriate judgements: Slips, mistakes or violations? 12
Cohen, L. J. Do, or should, all human decisions conform to the norms of a consumer-oriented culture? 12
Daniel, S. Correct decisions and their good consequences 13
Dwyer, S. Why care where moral intuitions come from? 14
Evans, J. St. B. T. Normative and descriptive consequentialism 15
Frisch, D. Consequentialism and utility theory 16
Fuller, S. Is consequentialism better regarded as a form of reasoning or as a pattern of behavior? 16
Glymour, C. Moral errors 17
Grush, R. Consequences of consequentialism 18
Heil, J. Truth or consequences 19
Irwin, J. R. Elicitation rules and incompatible goals 20
Jackson, F. Departing from consequentialism versus departing from decision theory 21
Katz, L. D. On begging the question when naturalizing norms 21
Levy, S. S. Jonathan Baron, consequentialism and error theory 22
McCain, R. A. Consequentialism in haste 23
Morton, A. Does consequentialism pay? 24
Oatley, K. Side effects: Limitations of human rationality 24
Phillips, G. M. Some examples of nonconsequentialist decisions 25
Pietroski, P. M. A "should" too many 26
Railton, P. Broadening the base for bringing cognitive psychology to bear on ethics 27
Ritov, I. Can goals be uniquely defined? 28
Schick, F. Goals, values and benefits 29
Spranca, M. D. What goals are to count? 29
Teigen, K. H. Actions, inactions and the temporal dimension 30
Tetlock, P. E. The consequences of taking consequentialism seriously 31

Author's Response

Baron, J. Normative, descriptive and prescriptive responses 32

Farah, M. J. Neuropsychological inference with an interactive brain: A critique of the "locality" assumption 43

Open Peer Commentary

Bullinaria, J. A. Simulating nonlocal systems: Rules of the game 61
Burton, A. M. & Bruce, V. Local representations without the locality assumption 62
Butterworth, B. Regional specialities 63
Campbell, J. I. D. Locality, modularity and numerical cognition 63
Campbell, R. Discarding locality assumptions: Problems and prospects 64
Carey, D. P. & Milner, A. D. Casting one's net too widely? 65
Chater, N. Modularity, interaction and connectionist neuropsychology 66
Clark, J. M. Modularity, abstractness and the interactive brain 67
Davidoff, J. & Renault, B. Further advantages of abandoning the locality assumption in face recognition 68
Diederich, J. Neurocomputing and modularity 68
Glymour, C. Clarifying the locality assumption 69
Grodzinsky, Y. & Hadar, U. No threat to modularity 70
Humphreys, G. W. & Riddoch, M. J. Go with the flow but mind the details 71
Kinsbourne, M. Do neuropsychologists think in terms of interactive models? 72
McCarthy, R. A. Neuropsychology: Going loco? 73
Mesulam, M.-M. Distributed locality and large-scale neurocognitive networks 74
Oaksford, M. Computational levels again 76
Plaut, D. C. Parallel distributed processing challenges the strong modularity hypothesis, not the locality assumption 77
Posner, M. I. Local and distributed processes in attentional orienting 78
Sekuler, R. Perception and its interactive substrate: Psychophysical linking hypotheses and psychophysical methods 79
Semenza, C. Locus-pocus (which and whose locality assumption?) 80
Servos, P. & Olds, E. M. Throwing out the neuropsychological data with the locality bathwater? 80
Small, S. L. The real functional architecture is gray, wet and slippery 81
Umiltà, C. The functional architecture of visual attention may still be modular 82
van Gelder, T. Playing Flourens to Fodor's Gall 84
Van Gulick, R. Prosopagnosia, conscious awareness and the interactive brain 84
van Hezewijk, R. & de Haan, E. H. F. The symbolic brain or the invisible hand? 85
Wasserman, G. S. The localization/distribution distinction in neuropsychology is related to the isomorphism/multiple meaning distinction in cell electrophysiology 87
Young, A. W. What counts as local? 88
Zurif, E. & Swinney, D. Modularity need not imply locality: Damaged modules can have nonlocal effects 89

Author's Response

Farah, M. J. Interactions on the interactive brain 90

Killeen, P. R. Mathematical principles of reinforcement 105

Open Peer Commentary

Bolles, R. C. The response problem 135
Bradshaw, C. M. Validation of behavioural equations: Can neurobiology help? 136
Davis, H. What defines a legitimate issue for Skinnerian psychology: Philosophy or technology? 137
Donahoe, J. W. What do reinforcers strengthen? The unit of selection 138
Galbicka, G. Moving beyond schedules and rate: A new trajectory? 139
Gregson, R. A. M. Has learning been shown to be attractor modification within reinforcement modelling? 140
Hanson, S. J. Reinforcement without representation 141
Krank, M. D. Integration and specificity of retrieval in a memory-based model of reinforcement 142
Lattal, K. A. & Abreu-Rodrigues, J. Memories and functional response units 143
Metzger, M. A. & Sagvolden, T. Killeen's theory provides an answer – and a question 144
Nevin, J. A. Extension to multiple schedules: Some surprising (and accurate) predictions 145
Pear, J. J. Problems and pitfalls for Killeen's mathematical principles of reinforcement 146
Rachlin, H. From overt behavior to hypothetical behavior to memory: Inference in the wrong direction 147
Reed, P. Memory and the integration of response sequences 148
Shimp, C. P. Awareness and reinforcement 149
Shull, R. L. Practical effects of response specification 150
Stephens, D. W. The scale of nature: Fitted parameters and dimensional correctness 150
Svartdal, F. Short-term memory in human operant conditioning 152
Timberlake, W. Animal-centered models of reinforcement 153
Walker, S. F. How general is a general theory of reinforcement? 154
Wearden, J. H. Fifty years on: The new "principles of behavior"? 155
Wilkie, D. M. & Saksida, L. M. A mathematical theory of reinforcement: An unexpected place to find support for analogical memory coding 155
Wynne, C. D. L. The return of the reinforcement theorists 156

Author's Response

Killeen, P. R. Rats, responses and reinforcers: Using a little psychology on our subjects 157

Continuing Commentary

On Previc, F. H. (1990) Functional specialization in the lower and upper visual fields in humans: Its ecological origins and neurophysiological implications. BBS 13:519–575. 173

Whishaw, I. Q. How do primates reach? 173

Author's Response

Previc, F. H. Neuropsychology and the art of reaching 174

On Dennett, D. C. & Kinsbourne, M. (1992) Time and the observer: The where and when of consciousness in the brain. BBS 15:183–247. 175

Bogen, J. E. Descartes' fundamental mistake: Introspective singularity 175
Johnsen, B. C. A model devoid of consciousness 176
Revonsuo, A. The "Multiple Drafts" model and the ontology of consciousness 177

Authors' Response

Dennett, D. C. & Kinsbourne, M. Counting consciousnesses: None, one, two, or none of the above? 178

On Pinker, S. & Bloom, P. (1990) Natural language and natural selection. BBS 13:707–784. 180

Gomila, A. The functionality of the study of language origin 180
Sussman, H. M. Let's get down to the "wetware" and look at evolutionarily motivated mechanisms 182

Authors' Response

Pinker, S. & Bloom, P. Humans did not evolve from bats 183

Corrigendum

Continuing Commentary: Martin Davis [BBS 16(3) 1993] on Roger Penrose [BBS 13(4) 1990], "Précis of *The emperor's new mind: Concerning computers, minds, and the laws of physics.*" 185

Contents Volume 17:2 June 1994

Jeannerod, M. The representing brain: Neural correlates of motor intention and imagery 187

Open Peer Commentary

Bajcsy, R. Do object affordances represent the functionality of an object? 202
Buneo, C. A. & Flanders, M. On the limitations of imaging imagining 202
Chua, R. & Weeks, D. J. Cognitive and motor implications of mental imagery 203
Contreras-Vidal, J. L., Banquet, J. P., Brebion, J. & Smith, M. J. The creative brain: Symmetry breaking in motor imagery 204
Corcos, D. M. Temporal representation in the control of movement 206
Dufour, R., Fischer, M. H. & Rosenbaum, D. A. Moving beyond imagination 206
Elliott, D. & Maraj, B. K. V. Visual-spatial movement goals 207
Fuster, J. M. Call it what it is: Motor memory 208
Gandevia, S. C. Peripheral and central correlates of attempted voluntary movements 208
Grush, R. Motor models as steps to higher cognition 209
Hallett, M., Fieldman, J., Cohen, L. G., Sadato, N. & Pascual-Leone, A. Involvement of primary motor cortex in motor imagery and mental practice 210
Ingvar, D. H. Motor memory – a memory of the future 210
Jackendoff, R. & Landau, B. What is coded in parietal representations? 211
Kainen, P. C. Synergy versus schema 212
Klatzky, R. L. On the relation between motor imagery and visual imagery 212
Milner, A. D., Carey, D. P. & Harvey, M. Visually guided action and the "need to know" 213
Mitchell, R. W. Are motor images based on kinesthetic-visual matching? 214
Morton, A. Motor simulation 215
Pailhous, J. & Bonnard, M. Jeannerod's representing brain: Image or illusion? 215
Pellizzer, G. & Georgopoulos, A. P. Representations of movement and representations in movement 216
Prinz, W. Motor images are action plans 218
Requin, J. To dream is not to (intend to) do 218
Rizzolatti, G. Nonconscious motor images 220
Roll, J. P., Gilhodes, J. C. & Roll, R. Kinaesthetic illusions as tools in understanding motor imagery 220
Sanes, J. N. Neurophysiology of preparation, movement and imagery 221
Sinha, C. Canonical representations and constructive praxis: Some developmental and linguistic considerations 223
Skokowski, P. G. How do we satisfy our goals? 224
Strong, G. W. Separability of reference frame distinctions from motor and visual images 224
Van der Heijden, A. H. C. & Bridgeman, B. Action and attention 225
Vogt, S. Imagery needs preparation too 226
Walter, C. B. & Swinnen, S. P. Potential disparities between imagining and preparing motor skills 227
Whiting, H. T. A. & Ingvaldsen, R. P. The mystery-mastery-imagery complex 228

Author's Response

Jeannerod, M. Motor representations and reality 229

Bridgeman, B., Van der Heijden, A. H. C. & Velichkovsky, B. M. A theory of visual stability across saccadic eye movements 247

Open Peer Commentary

Chekaluk, E. Is there a role for extraretinal factors in the maintenance of stability in a structured environment? 258
Dassonville, P., Schlag, J. & Schlag-Rey, M. Just how different are perceptual and visuomotor localization abilities? 258
Deubel, H. & Schneider, W. X. Perceptual stability and postsaccadic visual information: Can man bridge a gap? 259
Enright, J. T. Voluntary oscillopsia: Watching the world go round 260
Grüsser, O.-J. Early concepts on efference copy and reafference 262
Harris, L. R. Keeping track of visual codes that move from cell to cell during eye movements 265
Irwin, D. E., McConkie, G. W., Carlson-Radvansky, L. A. & Currie, C. A localist evaluation solution for visual stability across saccades 265
Jüttner, M. Visual stability and transsaccadic information processing 266
Karn, K. S., Lachter, J., Møller, P. & Hayhoe, M. Task dependent spatial memory across saccades 267
Mateeff, S. & Hohnsbein, J. Is there any essential difference between the "calibration" and "elimination" solutions? 268
Mittelstaedt, H. Theory of coordinate transformation by efference copy survives another attack 269
O'Regan, J. K. The world as an outside iconic memory – no strong internal metric means no problem of visual stability 270
Owens, D. A. & Reed, E. S. Seeing where we look: Fixation as extraretinal information 271
Paillard, J., Fleury, M., Teasdale, N., Bard, C. & Nougier, V. The perceptual stability of the visual field: What is calibration for? 272
Petrov, A. P. The "calibration" solution still leaves much work to be done 273
Pouget, A. & Sejnowski, T. J. Is perception isomorphic with neural activity? 274
Prablanc, C. Neuronal death of the cancellation theory? 274
Robinson, D. N. On the locus of visual stability 275
Shebilske, W. L. Calibration models and ecological efference mediation theory: Toward a synthesis of indirect and direct perception theories 276

Smeets, J. B. J. & Brenner, E. Stability relative to what? 277
Sokolov, E. N. Vector code in space constancy 278
Stoper, A. E. The translation solution plus motion suppression account for perceived stability 278
Strong, G. W. There is no "point" to space 279
Trehub, A. What does calibration solve? 279
van Donkelaar, P. & Windhorst, U. Visual stability: What is new? 280
Wertheim, A. H. Fixations or smooth eye movements? 281

Authors' Response

Bridgeman, B., Van der Heijden, A. H. C. & Velichkovsky, B. M. How our world remains stable despite disturbing influences 282

Wertheim, A. H. Motion perception during self-motion: The direct versus inferential controversy revisited **293**

Open Peer Commentary

Andersen, G. J. Analysis of information for 3-D motion perception: The role of eye movements 311
Becker, W. & Mergner, T. A theory of the perceptual stability of the visual world rather than of motion perception 312
Belopolsky, V. I. Frame and metrics for the reference signal 313
Boothe, R. G. Biological perception of self-motion 314
Bridgeman, B. & Blouin, J. Extending reference signal theory to rapid movements 315
Büttner, U. & Straube, A. Ego- and object-motion perception: Where does it take place? 316
Coombs, D. Sensor fusion in motion perception 317
da Vitoria Lobo, N. Direct perception theory needs to include computational reasoning, not extraretinal information 318
Gregson, R. A. M. Ambiguities in mathematically modelling the dynamics of motion perception 318
Hadani, I. & Julesz, B. Computational aspects of motion perception during self-motion 319
Held, R. The inferential model of motion perception during self-motion cannot apply at constant velocity 320
Honda, H. Some problems with the gain of the reference signal 321
Kim, N.-G. & Turvey, M. T. Optical foundations of perceived ego motion 322
Mateeff, S. & Hohnsbein, J. Wertheim's "reference" signal: Successful in explaining perception of absolute motion, but how about relative motion? 323
Previc, F. H. Inferring the visual reference 324
Probst, T. Why another alternative optokinetic model? 325
Riccio, G. E. Perception of motion with respect to multiple criteria 326
Rieser, J. J. Ego-centered and environment-centered perceptions of self-movement 328
Ross, H. E. Active and passive head and body movements 329
Sauvan, X. M. What does linear vection tell us about the optokinetic pathway? 330
Shebilske, W. L. Ecological efference mediation theory and motion perception during self-motion 330
Skavenski, A. A. The idea that space perception involves more than eye movement signals and the position of the retinal image has come up before 331
Stroffregen, T. A. "Sensory" reference frames and the information for self-motion versus object motion 332
Stoper, A. E. Does the reference signal cancel visual field motion? 333
Swanston, M. Spatial motion perception requires the perception of distance 334
Thier, P., Erickson, R. G. & Dichgans, J. A cortical substrate for motion perception during self-motion 335
Tresilian, J. R. Two straw men stay silent when asked about the "direct" versus "inferential" controversy 335
Velichkovsky, B. M. & Van der Heijden, A. H. C. Space as reference signal? Elaborate it in depth! 337
Wann, J. & Rushton, S. The illusion of self-motion in virtual reality environments 338
Yardley, L. The significance of the active pick-up of information in ecological theories of motion perception 340

Author's Response

Wertheim, A. H. Motion perception: Rights, wrongs and further speculations 340

Contents Volume 17:3 September 1994

Shanks, D. R. & St. John, M. F. Characteristics of dissociable human learning systems 367

Open Peer Commentary

Andrade, J. Is learning during anaesthesia implicit? 395
Baeyens, F., De Houwer, J. & Eelen, P. Awareness inflated, evaluative conditioning underestimated 396
Berry, D. C. A step too far? 397
Bornstein, R. F. Are subliminal mere exposure effects a form of implicit learning? 398
Brody, N. & Crowley M. J. Of what are we aware? 399
Carlson, R. A. Is implicit learning about consciousness? 400
Catania, A. C. The aware pigeon 400
Cleeremans, A. Awareness and abstraction are graded dimensions 402
Dienes, Z. & Perner, J. Dissociable definitions of consciousness 403
Ennen, E. Implicit practical learning 404
Goldstone, R. L. & Kruschke, J. K. Are rules and instances subserved by separate systems? 405
Holyoak, K. J. & Gattis, M. Implicit assumptions about implicit learning 406
Howe, M. L. & Rabinowitz, F. M. Development, learning, and consciousness 407
Kimmel, H. D. Human autonomic conditioning without awareness 408
Kourtzi, Z., Oliver, L. M. & Gluck, M. A. Can procedural learning be equated with unconscious learning or rule-based learning? 408
Lachter, J. Consciousness in natural language and motor learning 409
Lindsay, R. O. & Gorayska, B. Tacit knowledge and verbal report: On sinking ships and saving babies 410
Marsolek, C. J. Implementational constraints on human learning and memory systems 411
Merikle, P. M. On the futility of attempting to demonstrate null awareness 412
Nagata, H. Faulty rationale for the two factors that dissociate learning systems 412
Overskeid, G. The intuitive mind 414
Packard, M. G. Dissociating multiple memory systems: Don't forsake the brain 414
Perruchet, P. & Gallego, J. What about unconscious processing during the test? 415
Poldrack, R. A. & Cohen, N. J. On the representational/computational properties of multiple memory systems 416
Rakover, S. S. Learning without awareness: What counts as an appropriate test of learning and of awareness 417
Reber, A. S. & Winter, B. What manner of mind is this? 418
Reed, J. & Johnson, P. New evidence for unconscious sequence learning 419
Rizzo, A. & Parlangeli, O. Learning strategies and situated knowledge 420
Seger, C. A. Criteria for implicit learning: Deemphasize conscious access, emphasize amnesia 421
Squire, L. R., Hamann, S. & Knowlton, B. Dissociable learning and memory systems of the brain 422
Stadler, M. A. & Frensch, P. A Whither learning, whither memory? 423
Svartdal, F. Is awareness necessary for operant conditioning? 424
Terrace, H. S. Are infants human? 425
Willingham, D. B. On the creation of classification systems of memory 426

Authors' Response

Shanks, D. R. & St. John, M. F. How should implicit learning be characterized? 427

Continuing Commentary

On Greenfield, P. M. (1991) Language, tools and brain: The ontogeny and phylogeny of hierarchically organized sequential behavior. BBS 14:531–595. 357

Andreae, J. H. & Ryan, S. W. Associative learning and task complexity 357
Pepperberg, I. M. Language and cognition: The interesting case of subjects "P" 359
Westergaard, G. C. Language, tools and neurobehavioral laterality 360

Authors' Response

Piñon, D. & Greenfield, P. M. Does everybody do it? Hierarchically organized sequential activity in robots, birds and monkeys 361

Eichenbaum, H., Otto, T. & Cohen, N. J. Two functional components of the hippocampal memory system 449

Open Peer Commentary

Aggleton, J. P. Is Eichenbaum et al.'s proposal testable and how extensive is the hippocampal memory system? 472
Bingman, V. P. Remembering spatial cognition as a hippocampal functional component 473
Bolhuis, J. J. & Reid, I. C. The hippocampal system, time, and memory representations 474
Brown, M. W. Recording the recognition due to the parahippocampal region places hippocampal relational encoding in context 474
Fuster, J. M. In search of the engrammer 476

Gluck, M. A., Myers, C. E. & Goebel, J. K. A computational perspective on dissociating hippocampal and entorhinal function 476
Good, M. A. & Morris, R. G. M. A step linking memory to understanding? 477
Gray, J. A., Sinden, J. & Hodges, H. Psychoarithmetic or pick your own? 478
Grossberg, S. Hippocampal modulation of recognition, conditioning, timing, and space: Why so many functions? 479
Hampson, R. E. & Deadwyler, S. A. Hippocampal representations of DMS/DNMS in the rat 480
Horel, J. A The localization of general memory functions 482
Humphreys, M. S. & Dennis, S. Going from task descriptions to memory structures 483
Jarrard, L. E. A call for greater concern regarding the underlying anatomy 483
Katz, D. B. & Steinmetz, J. E. How long do relational representations in the hippocampus last during classical eyelid conditioning? 484
Kesner, R. P. Hippocampus and memory for time 485
Mayes, A. R. What exactly do amnesics fail to store normally? 486
McNaughton, N. The hippocampus: Relational processor or antiprocessor? 487
Miller, E. K. Neocortical memory traces 488
Murray, E. A. Relational but not spatial memory: The task at hand 489
Nadel, L. Hippocampus, space, and relations 490
Rapp, P. R. Functional components of the hippocampal memory system: Implications for future learning and memory research in nonhuman primates 491
Rawlins, J. N. P., Deacon, R. M. J., Yee, B. K. & Cassaday, H. J. Does it still make sense to develop a declarative memory theory of hippocampal function? 492
Shapiro, M. L. From Heisenberg's cat to Eichenbaum's rat: Uncertainty in predicting the neural requirements for animal behavior 493
Solomon, P. R. & Yang, B.-Y. What are the best strategies for understanding hippocampal function? 494
Squire, L. R., Zola-Morgan, S. & Alvarez, P. Functional distinctions within the medial temporal lobe memory system: What is the evidence? 495
Suzuki, W. A. What can neuroanatomy tell us about the functional components of the hippocampal memory system? 496
Tulving, E. & Markowitsch, H. J. What do animal models of memory model? 498
Wilson, F. A. W. Hippocampal neuronal activity in rat and primate: Memory and movement 499

Authors' Response

Eichenbaum, H., Otto, T. & Cohen, N. J. The hippocampal memory system and its functional components: Further explication and clarification 500

Boden, M. A. Précis of *The creative mind: Myths and mechanisms* **519**

Open Peer Commentary

Adams-Price, C. Can artificial intelligence explain age changes in literary creativity? 532
Bringsjord, S. Lady Lovelace had it right: Computers originate nothing 532
Bundy, A. What is the difference between real creativity and mere novelty? 533
Burns, B. D. Analogy programs and creativity 535
Campbell, R. L. On doing the impossible 535
Dartnall, T. Creativity, combination, and cognition 537
Donald, M. Computation: Part of the problem of creativity 537
Dunbar, K. & Baker, L. M. Goals, analogy, and the social constraints of scientific discovery 538
Fetzer, J. H. Creative thinking presupposes the capacity for thought 539
Flor, N. V. What about everyday creativity? 540
Fulford, K. W. M. Creativity, madness, and extra-strong AI 542
Gabora, L. M. The birth of an idea 543
Garnham, A. Art for art's sake 543
Gilhooly, K. J. Creativity theory: Detail and testability 544
Grasshoff, G. The historical basis of scientific discovery 545
Ippolito, M. F. Conscious thought processes and creativity 546
O'Rourke, J. The generative-rules definition of creativity 547
Pind, J. Computational creativity: What place for literature? 547
Ram, A., Domeshek, E., Wills, L., Nersessian, N. & Kolodner, J. Creativity is in the mind of the creator 549
Rehkämper, K. Imagery and creativity 550
Rowe, J. Creativity: Metarules and emergent systems 550
Shames, V. A. & Kihlstrom, J. F. Respecting the phenomenology of human creativity 551
Simonton, D. K. Individual differences, developmental changes, and social context 552
Sternberg, R. J. Can computers be creative, or even disappointed? 553
Treisman, M. Creativity: Myths? Mechanisms? 554
van der Maas, H. L. J. & Molenaar, P. C. M. The empirical detection of creativity 555
Weisberg, R. W. The creative mind versus the creative computer 555
Żytkow, J. M. Machine discoverers: Transforming the spaces they explore 557

Author's Response

Boden, M. A. Creativity: A framework for research 558

Continuing Commentary

On Cheney, D. L. & Seyfarth, R. M. (1992) Précis of *How monkeys see the world.* BBS 15:135–182. 571

Bekoff, M., Townsend, S. E. & Jamieson, D. Beyond monkey minds: Toward a richer cognitive ethology 571
Gallup, Jr., G. G. Monkeys, mirrors, and minds 572
Povinelli, D. J. A theory of mind is in the head, not the heart 573

Authors' Response

Cheney, D. & Seyfarth, R. Mirrors and the attribution of mental states 574

On Kenrick, D. T. & Keefe, R. C. (1992) Age preferences in mates reflect sex differences in human reproductive strategies. BBS 15:75–133. 578

Waller, N. G. Individual *differences* in age preferences in mates 578

Response to Waller, N. G. by Buss, D. M. Individual differences in mating strategies 581

Authors' Response

Kenrick, D. T. & Keefe, R. C. Gender and sexual orientation: Why the different age preferences? 582

Contents Volume 17:4 December 1994

Wilson, D. S. & Sober, E. Reintroducing group selection to the human behavioral sciences 585

Open Peer Commentary

Alroy, J. & Levine, A. Driving both ways: Wilson & Sober's conflicting criteria for the identification of groups as vehicles of selection 608
Batson, C. D. Seeing the light: What does biology tell us about human social behavior? 610
Brace, C. L. The consequences of group selection in a domain without genetic input: Culture 611
Bradie, M. Metaphors and mechanisms in vehicle-based selection theory 612
Burghardt, G. M. Group selection and the group mind in science 613
Campbell, D. T. & Gatewood, J. B. Ambivalently held group-optimizing predispositions 614
Cloak, F. T. Unnecessary competition requirement makes group selection harder to demonstrate 614
Cronk, L. Group selection's new clothes 615
Crow, J. F. In praise of replicators 616
Dawkins, R. Burying the vehicle 616
Dennett, D. C. E pluribus unum? 617
Dugatkin, L. A. Subtle ways of shifting the balance in favor of between-group selection 618
Dupré, J. Some philosophical implications of the rehabilitation of group selection 619
Frank, R. H. Group selection and "genuine" altruism 620
Gilbert, M. Me, you, and us: Distinguishing "egoism," "altruism," and "groupism" 621
Goodnight, C. J. Contextual analysis and group selection 622
Grantham, T. A. Putting the cart back behind the horse: Group selection does not require that groups be "organisms" 622
Griffiths, P. E. & Gray, R. D. Replicators and vehicles? Or developmental systems? 623
Heschl, A. Reconstructing the real unit of selection 624
Holcomb, H. R. III Empirically equivalent theories 625
Holsinger, K. E. Groups as vehicles and replicators: The problem of group-level adaptation 626
Hull, D. L. Taking vehicles seriously 627
Hyland, M. E. Different vehicles for group selection in humans 628
Lloyd, E. A. Rx: Distinguish group selection from group adaptation 628
MacDonald, K. Group evolutionary strategies: Dimensions and mechanisms 629
Miller, G. F. Beyond shared fate: Group-selected mechanisms for cooperation and competition in fuzzy, fluid vehicles 630
Moore, J. Hominids, coalitions, and weapons: Not vehicles 632
Nesse, R. M. Why is group selection such a problem? 633
Rapoport, A. Nongenetic and non-Darwinian evolution 634
Simpson, J. A. Adaptation and natural selection: A new look at some old ideas 634
Smith, E. A. Semantics, theory, and methodological individualism in the group-selection controversy 636
Thompson, N. S. Vehicles all the way down? 638
Wills, C. The maintenance of behavioral diversity in human societies 638

Authors' Response

Wilson, D. S. & Sober, E. Group selection: The theory replaces the bogey man 639

Humphreys, M. S., Wiles, J. & Dennis, S. Toward a theory of human memory: Data structures and access processes 655

Open Peer Commentary

Clarke, T. L. Inorganic memory 667
Golden, R. M. Strong and weak formal specifications 668
Greene, R. L. Why do we need a computational theory of laboratory tasks? 668
Heath, R. A. The cognitive RISC machine needs complexity 669
Jacobs, A. M. On computational theories and multilevel, multitask models of cognition: The case of word recognition 670
Kashima, Y. Memory and social cognition 672
Kinoshita, S. Does a computational theory of human memory need intelligence? 673
Lewis, R. L. Task-specification language, or theory of human memory? 674
Murnane, K. Caught in a bind: Context information and episodic memory 675
Murray, D. J. What are the "goals" of the human memory system? 676
Myung, I. J. Is the representation meaningful? A measurement theoretic view 677
Oscar-Berman, M. Brain damage and cognitive dysfunction 678
Sloman, S. A. Progress within the bounds of memory 679
Tiberghien, G. Can we really dissociate the computational and algorithm-level theories of human memory? 680
van der Velde, F., Wolters, G. & van der Heijden, A. H. C. Marr versus Marr: On the notion of levels 681

Authors' Response

Humphreys, M. S., Wiles, J. & Dennis, S. Beyond the Tower of Babel in human memory research: The validity and utility of specification 682

Karmiloff-Smith, A. Précis of *Beyond modularity: A developmental perspective on cognitive science* 693

Open Peer Commentary

Bloom, P. & Wynn, K. The real problem with constructivism 707
Boden, M. A. Representational redescription: A question of sequence 708
Bodor, P. & Pléh, C. A Fodorian guide to Switzerland: Jung and Piaget combined? 709
Campbell, R. L. What's getting redescribed? 710
Carassa, A. & Tirassa, M. Representational redescription and cognitive architectures 711
Dartnall, T. Redescribing redescription 712
de Gelder, B. The risks of rationalising cognitive development 713
Donald, M. Representation: Ontogenesis and phylogenesis 714
Estes, D. Developmental psychology for the twenty-first century 715
Foster-Cohen, S. H. Arguments against linguistic "modularization" 716
Freeman, N. H. Redescription of intentionality 717
Goldin-Meadow, S. & Alibali, M. W. Do you have to be right to redescribe? 718
Graham, G. Dissociation, self-attribution, and redescription 719
Grush, R. Beyond connectionist versus classical AI: A control theoretic perspective on development and cognitive science 720
Hampson, P. J. Representational redescription, memory, and connectionism 721
Johnston, T. D. Genes, development, and the "innate" structure of the mind 721
Kuhn, D. The power of explicit knowing 722
Losonsky, M. Beyond methodological solipsism? 723
Ohlsson, S. Representational change, generality versus specificity, and nature versus nurture: Perennial issues in cognitive research 724
Olson, D. R. Where redescriptions come from 725
Quartz, S. R. & Sejnowski, T. J. Beyond modularity: Neural evidence for constructivist principles in development 725
Rutkowska, J. C. Situating representational redescription in infants' pragmatic knowledge 726
Scholnick, E. K. Redescribing development 727
Shultz, T. R. The challenge of representational redescription 728
Smith, L. Modal knowledge and transmodularity 729
Vinter, A. & Perruchet, P. Is there an implicit level of representation? 730
Zelazo, P. D. From the decline of development to the ascent of consciousness 731

Author's Response

Karmiloff-Smith, A. Transforming a partially structured brain into a creative mind 732

Continuing Commentary

On Dawkins/Singer (1990) From an animal's point of view: Motivation, fitness, and animal welfare. BBS 13:1–61. 747

Bradshaw, R. H. & Bubier, N. E. The value of the consumer demand model to the science of animal welfare 747
Kiley-Worthington, M. Behavioural restriction, animal welfare, and choice experiments 748

Precommentary Author's Response

Singer, P. How to argue with egg producers 749

On Plomin, R. & Bergeman, C. S. (1991) The nature of nurture: Genetic influence on "environmental" measures. BBS 14:373–427. 750

Grimshaw, G. & Bryden, M. P. Genetic influences on the environment 750
Lamb, M. E. Heredity, environment, and the question "why?" 751

Authors' Response

Plomin, R. & Bergeman, C. S. More on the nature of nurture 751

On Golani, I. (1992) A mobility gradient in the organization of vertebrate movement: The perception of movement through symbolic language. BBS 15:249–308. 752

Hadar, U. Implications of methodological rigor in movement analysis for the study of human communication 753
Shepard, J. K. & Dourish, C. T. Implications of Eshkol-Wachman movement notation for behavioural pharmacology 754

Author's Response

Golani, I. The practicality of using the Eshkol-Wachman movement notation in behavioral pharmacology and kinesics 754

On Lockhead, G. R. (1992) Psychophysical scaling: Judgments of attributes or objects? BBS 15:543–601. 757

Allik, J. Is there any difference between attribute- and object-based psychophysics? 757
Booth, D. A. Recognition of objects by physical attributes 759
Pléh, C. The relative novelty of judgment relativity 760
Runeson, S. Psychophysics: The failure of an elementaristic dream 761
Sarris, V. Contextual effects in animal psychophysics: Comparative perception 763
Wasserman, G. S. Comparable context effects exist in physical, physiological, and psychophysical scales 764

Author's Response

Lockhead, G. R. Psychophysical measures of objects and their features: It is time for a change 766

On Johnson-Laird, P. N. & Byrne, R. M. J. (1993) Précis of *Deduction*. BBS 16:323–380. 772

Martín-Cordero, J. & González-Labra, M. J. Amnesic mental models do not completely spill the beans of deductive reasoning 773
Smith, L. Mental models and modality 774

Authors' Response

Johnson-Laird, P. N. & Byrne, R. M. J. Models, necessity, and the search for counterexamples 775

On Tomasello, M., Kruger, A. C. & Ratner, H. H. Cultural learning. BBS 16:495–552. 778

Chisholm, J. S. & Wescombe, N. Evolution, attachment, and cultural learning 778
Keller, H. & Chasiotis, A. "All I really need to know I learned in kindergarten" or is "cultural learning" anthropo-, ethno-, or adultocentric? 779
Pontecorvo, C. Rethinking learning processes and products 780

Authors' Response

Tomasello, M., Kruger, A. C. & Ratner, H. H. The role of emotions in cultural learning 782